February 2024 Problem of the Month
Lucky Numbers
Solution by : Koa Okano, Kalani High School

Assume that C is telling the truth

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (liar) |  |  |
| B (?) | 6 |  |
| C (truth) | Not 7 |  |
| D (?) |  |  |
| Missing \# : not 5 |  |  |

Assume that $D$ is telling the truth

- If the product of B's numbers is 24 , then B's Unlucky \# must be 4 .
- This implies that sum of the lucky and unlucky \# is 10
- A's lucky \# is larger than any of the other numbers
- This implies that A's lucky \# is either 8 or 9

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (liar) | 8 or 9 | 2 or 1 |
| B (liar) | 6 | 4 |
| C (truth) | Not 7 | Not 4 |
| D (truth) | Not 2 |  |
| Missing \# : not 5 |  |  |

Because we must use 5 (from A's claim that the missing number is 5), and the sum must add up to 10,5 can not belong to $D$ since that would require the usage of 5 twice. Similarly, we also can not use it for $C$. Hence there is no spot left for 5 to go which means $D$ is a liar.
Hence, we know that if $C$ is telling the truth then $A$ and $D$ are liars while $B$ and $C$ are truth teller.

Filling out from given information so far:

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (liar) | Not largest (not 8,9) |  |
| B (truth) | 6 | (not 4) |
| C (truth) | (not 7) | 4 |
| D (liar) | 2 |  |
| Missing \# : not 5 |  |  |

Recall :

- The sum of lucky and unlucky numbers is the same for all four persons
- D's unlucky number can not be 1,3 since C's sum is at least 5 .
- Sum of lucky number and unlucky number can not be 10 or 11
- D's unlucky number can not be 8 or 9

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (liar) | Not largest (not 8,9) |  |
| B (truth) | 6 | (not 4) |
| C (truth) | (not 7) | 4 |
| D (liar) | 2 | (not 1,3,8,9) |
| Missing \# : not 5 |  |  |

Assuming that D's unlucky number is 5 :

- A must use $7,8,9$ to total to 7 , which is impossible

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (liar) | 7 | $(8$, or 9) |
| B (truth) | 6 | 1 |
| C (truth) | 3 | 4 |
| D (liar) | 2 | 5 |
| Missing \# : not 5 |  |  |

Assuming that D's unlucky number is 7 :

- 2,3,4,5,6,7 gets used ; so A must use $1,8,9$ to total to 9 . Since A's lucky number can not be 8 or 9 , it must be 1 ; hence unlucky number is 8 , and missing number is 9

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (liar) | 1 | 8 |
| B (truth) | 6 | 3 |
| C (truth) | 5 | 4 |
| D (liar) | 2 | 7 |
| Missing \# : 9 |  |  |

The sum of the lucky numbers is less than the sum of the unlucky numbers, so C must be a liar

Assume that A is telling the truth

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (truth) |  |  |
| B (?) | Not 6 |  |
| C (liar) | 7 |  |
| D (?) |  |  |
| Missing \# : 5 |  |  |

Assume that $B$ is telling the truth :
In the end, you end up having to make 2 pairs of 11 while only using $1,3,6$, or 8 once which is not possible, so B must be a liar

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (truth) | $1,3,6$ | $1,3,6,8$ |
| B (truth) | $1,3,8$ | $1,3,6$ |
| C (liar) | 7 | 4 |
| D (liar) | 2 | 9 |
| Missing \# : 5 |  |  |

By process of elimination of liars and truth we found:

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (truth) | Largest, 8 or 9 |  |
| B (liar) | Not 6 | Multiply to 24 |
| C (liar) | 7 | Not 4 |
| D (truth) | Not 2 |  |
| Missing \# : 5 |  |  |

## Note that

- Only possible pairs of $B$ is $(4,6)$
- Missing number is 5 , and A's lucky number is larger than any of the other numbers, so it must be 9
- Sums of the lucky and unlucky numbers are the same for all four persons.
- C's unlucky number is 3
- A's unlucky number must be 1

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (truth) | 9 | 1 |
| B (liar) | 4 | 6 |
| C (liar) | 7 | 3 |
| D (truth) | Not 2 |  |
| Missing \# : 5 |  |  |

The only missing pair is $(2,8)$ or $(8,2)$, and lucky number can not be 2 so it is $(8,2)$

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (truth) | 9 | 1 |
| B (liar) | 4 | 6 |
| C (liar) | 7 | 3 |
| D (truth) | 8 | 2 |
| Missing \# : 5 |  |  |

Answer:
Lucky and unlucky numbers for each of them is the following :

|  | Lucky \# | Unlucky \# |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A (truth) | 9 | 1 |
| B (liar) | 4 | 6 |
| C (liar) | 7 | 3 |
| D (truth) | 8 | 2 |
| Missing \# : 5 |  |  |

